

“Name of Writer” & “Name of Reviewer” at the top

Part One—text editing

Part Two—content editing (answer these on a separate sheet)
Referring specifically to numbered sentences, answer thoroughly the following questions.

1. Does the writer provide a strong **introduction**? Why or why not?
2. Write down the **thesis** of this essay. What does the author want to show/tell us? Evaluate the effectiveness of the thesis, both in terms of its clarity and its actual intent.
3. Does the writer provide enough **background** to understand the context of the thesis? Give (or suggest) examples.
4. Outline the **structure** of the essay (e.g., what seem to be the main points in the sequence of the discussion). Is it static or progressive? Is it well-designed or confusing?
5. Are the **claims** adequately backed up with **evidence**? improved? How so? Any questionable **assumptions**?
6. Are **counterarguments** raised and refuted? Are there any counterarguments that the writer has not addressed?
7. Does the **conclusion** summarize and/or gracefully finish off the discussion?
8. How strong are the **sources** the writer has chosen? Are the cited materials adequate to the task?
9. Examine the **bibliography**. Is it correct and accurate? Are the sources well-chosen and diverse?
10. Please make some **overall comments** that you think may help this writer improve his or her argument.